

Hadith Controversy About Music (Study of Ibn Ḥazm and al-Mubārakfūrī's Understanding)

Rama Fadhli*

Universitas Muhammadiyah Sumatera Utara, Medan, Indonesia, 20238

Email: ramafadhli231003@gmail.com

Article	Received	Revised	Accepted	Available Online
history:	13 Januari 2025	05 Februari 2025	27 Februari 2025	01 Maret 2025

Abstract

Recently, scholars have been discussing a range of issues, including differences of opinion on the law concerning music consumption. This research aims to determine Ibn Ḥazm and al-Mubarakfuri's understanding of music through qualitative methods with descriptive-comparative data analysis techniques. The research findings indicate that Ibn Ḥazm challenges the hadith relied upon by scholars to prohibit music as weak, including those found in the works of al-Bukhārī. According to Ibn Ḥazm, the permissibility of music depends on whether it involves any immorality. On the other hand, al-Mubārakfūrī asserts that music is unequivocally forbidden, although he occasionally permits it under certain circumstances. It is important to note that the differences of opinion among scholars on this issue do not allow for personal preference based on the arguments of each side, as there is a hadith that nullifies one of the positions. In one case, Ibn Ḥazm's assertion regarding a weak hadith was later confirmed to be authentic, as agreed upon by scholars. Al-Mubārakfūrī maintains that music and musical instruments are impermissible without exception, despite his occasional permission for them.

Keywords: Music, Ibn Ḥazm, al-Mubārakfūrī

Abstrak

Belakangan ini para ulama sedang memperbincangkan permasalahan terkait perbedaan pendapat mengenai hukum mendengarkan musik. Penelitian ini bertujuan untuk mengetahui pandangan Ibnu Ḥazm dan al-Mubārakfūrī terhadap musik. Penelitian ini menggunakan metode kualitatif dengan teknik analisis data deskriptif-komparatif. Hasilnya menunjukkan bahwa Ibnu Ḥazm menganggap hadis yang dijadikan acuan para ulama dalam mengharamkan musik adalah lemah, termasuk riwayat al-Bukhārī. Menurut Ibnu Ḥazm, diperbolehkannya musik tergantung pada apakah musik itu maksiat. Sebaliknya, al-Mubārakfūrī memandang musik dilarang, namun membolehkannya pada waktu-waktu tertentu. Perbedaan pendapat di antara para ulama tidak memungkinkan adanya pilihan pribadi berdasarkan dalil mereka karena suatu hadis bertentangan dengan salah satu pandangan. Dalam kasus Ibnu Ḥazm, hadis yang dianggapnya lemah ternyata *ṣaḥīḥ* menurut para ulama. Al-Mubārakfūrī, sebaliknya, meyakini musik dan alat musik adalah haram yang sifatnya mutlaq, namun di sisi lain ia memperbolehkan hal tersebut.

Kata Kunci: Musik, Ibnu Ḥazm, al-Mubārakfūrī

Introduction

Recently, scholars have often discussed a problem, whether it is a new problem or one that has existed before. This issue has been raised again by the contemporary ulama, giving rise to among them, some camps allow it, some forbid it. As a result, ordinary people who have minimal knowledge of the problem take opinions that they think are correct without first conducting research into the truth (Yusram et al., 2020). Among the examples of issues related to differences of opinion in this case is the law regarding listening to music. Music is an art form that adds beauty and aesthetic value to human life (Sunarto, 2016). Music is an important part of life and can have a profound impact on a person. Through music, an individual can convey a message to society about their conscience (Marwi et al., 2023). Music can also contribute to mental stability, and its rhythm can enhance deep concentration (Djohan et al., 2022).

Music is central to human life as it fulfills the soul's need for natural self-expression through sound (Khoiriyah & Sinaga, 2017). Music and singing are widely used for entertainment by almost every group today. It's rare to find a place without music and singing, whether it's at home, the office, a shop, on a bus or in a private car, in public places, or hospitals. Even some of the most revered places, such as mosques, are not free from the influence of music (Rahwan & Baharun, 2022).

Recently, some Muslims find the growing trend of singing and listening to music disturbing (Syaf'i & Rahman, 2022). Today, many music lovers idolize pagan musicians and singers, who not only follow destructive pagan beliefs but also promote a modern culture that is frenzied and focused on gaining a reputation. This influence can negatively impact the younger generation, especially those from the Muslim community (Muhabbatillah & Gunawan, 2020). The lifestyle of idols, prone to immorality, negatively influences the young Muslim generation. These concerns have long existed in Islamic discourse and continue to this day (Herlina, 2023).

On the other hand, many Muslim artists feel anxious when they see non-Muslim musicians and singers succeeding in the world music scene (As'ad et al., 2023). The tension is exacerbated by a lack of understanding of Islamic teachings, which leads some individuals to seek to emulate controversial musical genres that they assert are Islamic. This type of music, characterized by religious themes and often featuring vocals, is commonly referred to as qasida or desert rhythm, and it is intended to spread the message of Islam (Lesmana P et al., 2015).

In an era where life and art are inseparable, understanding art from an Islamic perspective is vital. In this perspective, humans are seen as free beings not controlled by their consciousness (Komala & Ridwan, 2022). Many of the Prophet Muhammad's teachings were not understood by his followers regarding the purpose behind his instructions, recommendations, and prohibitions (Siregar, 2018). In this case, it seems that society is too complacent and immersed in the world of excessive entertainment, to the extent of exceeding the limits set by Allah Swt. Additionally,

people are actively participating in the world of art as part of their daily lives. Nowadays, art has become an integral part of people's lifestyle (Parmajaya, 2020).

In previous studies, Diah Yuliarizki and Dwi Apriana discussed the debate surrounding singing with musical instruments among the ulama. Upon deeper examination, they concluded that the issue is not with the musical instrument itself, as it is simply an object and therefore not inherently haram. Since there are no specific laws concerning objects, such as musical instruments, their use is permissible if there is a good purpose, such as for da'wah. In this case, the permissibility of using a musical instrument depends on the intention and purpose of the user (Yuliarizki, 2023). Amir Mahmud also mentioned that the hadiths discussing music can be divided into two categories based on their editors. One category of hadiths forbids music, while the other allows it. Both categories of hadiths are considered authentic (*ṣaḥīḥ*). However, upon closer examination, the hadiths that prohibit music are considered weaker in terms of their authenticity compared to the hadiths that allow music (Mahmud, 2017).

According to the explanation above, music plays an important role in Islamic society. It has been used as a form of entertainment by various groups throughout history. As a result, scholars have different interpretations of the hadith regarding music. Some scholars who believe that music has a negative impact tend to prohibit it, while those who view it positively tend to permit its use. In this research, the aim is to delve into the perspectives of Ibn Ḥazm and al-Mubārakfūrī as presented in the books *al-Muḥallā bi al-Aṣar* by Ibnu Ḥazm and *Tuḥfah al-Aḥwāzī* by al-Mubārakfūrī, to compare their interpretations of the hadith concerning music. The research seeks to address contemporary issues surrounding the permissibility of listening to music within Muslim communities.

Method

This research is qualitative, namely, research carried out to collect and analyze data from various sources of written materials, both from libraries, in the form of books, journals, and various other library sources that become research references (Sugiyono, 2018). Qualitative methods are being employed to critically analyze Ibn Ḥazm and al-Mubārakfūrī's understanding of hadith regarding music. The primary sources used for this analysis are the books *al-Muḥallā bi al-Aṣar* and *Tuḥfah al-Aḥwāzī*. Additionally, secondary sources such as sharh hadith books, other books, and journals were consulted. Data for this research was collected through documentation studies of library data relevant to the topic. The data analysis technique used is descriptive-comparative, which involves describing and comparing the content. In this case, the author compares the books *al-Muḥallā bi al-Aṣar* and *Tuḥfah al-Aḥwāzī*.

Results and Discussion

Definition of Music

According to the Indonesian Dictionary, music is the science or art of arranging tones or sounds in sequences, combinations, and temporal relationships to produce sound positions that have unity and continuity (Indonesia, 2018). Apart from this definition, music can also be interpreted as tones or sounds that are arranged in such a way that they contain rhythm, song, and harmony, especially those that use instruments capable of producing sounds (Yusram et al., 2020).

Meanwhile, music in Arabic comes from the word *al-Ginā'*, which means singing or humming and typically involves composed sentences accompanied by musical instruments or performed without them (Muṣṭafā, 2004). Aside from the earlier definition of music, it has special definitions from different experts in the field. Pono Banoe defines music as an art form that arranges various sounds into patterns that humans can understand, with supporting elements of melody, rhythm, and harmony (Ardena, 2020). The word music originates from the Greek word *muse*, which refers to one of the gods in ancient Greek mythology governing the arts and sciences. In essence, to the ancient Greeks, the muse was the god of art and science (Najamudin & Riadi, 2019).

Sunarko stated that music is the expression of the contents of the human heart through organized sounds, characterized by melody, rhythm, and harmonious elements (Simatupang & Rosalianisa, 2021). Bahari defines music as the science and art of the rhythmic combination of tones, both vocal and instrumental. This combination includes melody and harmony, expressing everything, especially the emotional aspect (Yuniar et al., 2022). From the description above, music can be understood as a form of art that processes and arranges words in rhythm to create harmony when heard.

Biography of Ibn Ḥazm and al-Mubārakfūrī

1. Ibn Ḥazm and the Book of *al-Muḥallā bi al-Aṣar*

Ibn Ḥazm's full name is 'Alī bin Aḥmad bin Sa'īd bin Ḥazm bin Gālib bin Ṣāliḥ bin Khalaf bin Mu'dān bin Sufyān bin Yazīd bin al-Fārisī al-Andalusī (Zuhri, 2016). In his various works, Ibn Hazm often used the pseudonym Abu Muhammad. However, he is more popularly known as Ibn Hazm in the wider community. It is worth noting that this name or nickname is technically incorrect, as Ibn Hazm al-Andalusī means son of Hazm, while Hazm himself held the status of Ibn Hazm's great-grandfather. Nevertheless, the use of such terms seems to be widely accepted and commonplace within Islamic communities (Yusram et al., 2020). Ibn Hazm al-Andalusian was born to the east of Cordova, on a Wednesday morning before sunrise, at the end of the month of Ramadan in 384 AH (7 November 994 AD) (Zuhri, 2016). The place and date of birth are undisputed among historians, as the information comes from Ibn Ḥazm al-Andalusī himself. Ibnu Ḥazm mentioned these details in a letter sent to his colleague, Ṣa'īd bin Aḥmad (d. 462 AH) (Akbar et al., 2019).

Ibn Hazm was a scholar with deep knowledge and broad culture. He gained knowledge through his travels to several cities in Andalusia, and his movement from one region to another in search of information was caused by political instability in Andalusia (Rizqi, 2023). In his pursuit of knowledge, Ibn Ḥazm faced interference and pressure. Despite the turmoil and oppression, he was praised by the ulama (Waddin & Fikriyah, 2022). Ibn Hazm acquired his multidimensional knowledge from his mother. He learned to read and memorize the Quran, write, and acquire basic knowledge (Muhammad, 2015).

In his quest for knowledge, Ibn Hazm studied with several renowned scholars. He began his studies with Abū 'Umar Aḥmad bin Muḥamad bin al-Jaswār. In the field of logic, he studied with Muḥammad bin al-Ḥasan al-Maḥhajī. In addition to logic, Ibn Ḥazm also delved into fiqh and hadith, learning from 'Alī 'Abdullāh al-Azdī, also known as Ibn al-Farqī. Mas'ūd bin Sulaimān bin Maflat Abū al-Khayyār was his teacher at the Zahirī school (Mursī, 2015). One of Ibn Hazm's famous students was Muḥammad bin Abū Nasr Futuh al-Azdī al-Ḥumaidī al-Andalūsī al-Miwarqī. Among his special students were al-Qāḍī Abū al-Qāsim Sa'id bin Aḥmad al-Andalūsī, and other students included Abū Muḥammad 'Abdullah bin Muḥammad bin al-Arabī and Ibn Ḥazm's son, Abū Rāfi' (Ḥimāyah, 2017).

The works of Ibn Ḥazm that can be found today include: *Al-Muḥallā bi al-Aṣar*, *Murātib al-Ijmā'*, *Al-Imlā' fī Qawā'id al-Fiqh*, *Al-Ijmā' wa Masailuh 'alā Abwāb al-Fiqh*, *Al-Taṣaffuh fī al-Fiqh*, *Al-Majallā fī al-Fiqh 'alā Maḥabih wa Ijtihādih*, *Mulakhkhaṣ Ibtāl al-Qiyās wa al-Ra'y wa al-Istiḥsān wa al-Taqlīd wa al-Ta'līl*, *Al-Iḥkām fī Uṣūl al-Aḥkām*, *Manẓūmah fī Qawā'id Uṣūl al-Fiqh al-Dzahirī*, *Al-Nasāikh wa al-Mansūkh*, *Al-Jāmi' fī Ṣaḥīḥ al-Aḥādīṣ Ikhtisārih al-Asānīd wa al-Ikhtisār 'alā al-Ṣaḥīḥa wa Ijtilāb Akmal al-Faṣlaḥ wa al-Ṣaḥīḥ Ma'ānihā*, *Juz fī Auḥam al-Ṣaḥīḥain*, and *Mukhtaṣar fī l'lāl al-Hadith* (Sahputra & Farma, 2023).

One of Ibn Ḥazm's notable works is the book *al-Muḥallā bi al-Aṣar*, which is widely renowned among the Muslim community in the field of Islamic jurisprudence (fiqh). It has received constructive commentary from scholars. The distinct feature of this book is its comprehensive explanation, which elucidates Ibn Ḥazm's arguments based on the Quran, Hadith, and consensus (*ijma'*) (Salam, 2019).

In the book *al-Muḥallā bi al-Aṣar*, the discussion starts with faith, *mu'āmalah*, *jināyah*, *munakahat*, worship, and also law, consisting of 63 chapters. The first chapter is the book of monotheism, then continues with the fiqh chapter, namely *ṭahārah*, *tayamum*, *ḥaiḍ*, *istiḥāḍah*, prayer, corpses, funeral prayers, the laws of the dead, *i'tikaf*, zakat, fasting, hajj, and so on, until ending with the book of war and theft. Ibn Ḥazm died on August 15, 1064 (Suherman & Hafis, 2022).

2. Al-Mubārakfūrī and the Book of *Tuḥfah al-Aḥwāzī*

Al-Mubārakfūrī has the full name Abū al-'Ulā Muḥammad 'Abdurrahmān bin 'Abdurrahīm al-Mubārakfūrī, born in 1283 Hijri ten years after Abādī's birth in the village of Mubarakfur (Ikhwansyah et al., 2023). Al-Mubārakfūrī was raised in his

hometown under the care of his father. He received an education in Islamic principles and spent his childhood immersed in reading. He learned to read the Quran and was proficient in both Urdu and Persian. Later, he continued to travel and deepen his religious knowledge through further exploration within the country (Izani & Rubini, 2021).

Al-Mubārakfūrī studied various sciences, including Arabic language, such as shoraf, nahwu, fiqh, *uṣūl* fiqh, and mantiq. He learned from Sheikh Hisyāmuddīn al-Ma'wī, Faiḍullāh al-Ma'wī, and Salāmatullāh al-Jirajfūrī. Additionally, he gained knowledge of hadith and tafsīr from his father and received teachings from al-Imām al-Ḥafīẓ 'Abdullāh al-Ma'wī (Firdaus, 2014). After studying with local scholars for five years, al-Mubārakfūrī expanded his area of study with the guidance and blessing of his teachers and father. He continued his scientific journey to Delhi, where he deepened his knowledge of hadith by studying the books of *Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhārī*, *Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim*, *Sunan Abū Dāwud*, and *Sunan al-Tirmizī* with Naḍīr Ḥusain al-Bihārī. He then returned to deepen the same knowledge with Ḥusain bin Muḥsin al-Anṣārī al-Yamānī and obtained a sanad diploma from him at the same time (Ferdiansyah, 2015).

His great teachers in the science of *'aql* and in the science of *naql* (hadith, tafsīr, sīrah) include: Syeikh 'Abdullāh al-Ma'wī, al-Gāzifūrī, al-Dahlāwī, Abū Ḥanīfah, Jurjānī, Ibnu Aḍām, Ibnu Ḥanbal, Nadzir Ḥusain al-Bahārī, al-Dahāwī, and others. When he felt he had enough, al-Mubārakfūrī returned to his hometown to practice his knowledge by teaching, writing, opening a madrasa, and lecturing. Among his students were 'Abdul Salām al-Mubārakfūrī, 'Ubaidullāh al-Raḥmānī, Muḥammad bin 'Abd al-Qādir al-Hilālī, 'Abdullāh al-Najdī Quwai'i, Ruqayyah bint Khalīl bin Muḥammad bin Ḥusain bin Muḥ sin al-Anṣārī, 'Abdul Jabbār, Muḥammad Ishāq al-Arāwī, Muḥammad Basyīr al-Mubārakfūrī, 'Abd al-Razzāq al-Ṣādiqfūrī, Muḥammad Ismā'il al-Mubārakfūrī, Aḥmad al-Amlāwī, and others. Al-Mubārakfūrī died in 1934 AD (Indah et al., 2021).

Al-Mubārakfūrī has quite a lot of works, including: *Tuḥfah al-Aḥwāzī Syarḥ Jāmi' al-Tirmizī*, *Muqaddimah Tuḥfah al-Aḥwāzī*, *Abkār al-Manān fī Tanqīdī Āsar al-Sunan*, *Tahqīq al-Kal ām fī Wujūb al-Qirā'ah Kholfa al-Imām*, *Khoir al-Mā'ūn fī Man'I al-Firār min al-Ṭā'ūn*, *Al-Maqālah al-Ḥusna fī Sunniyah al-Muṣafahah bi al-Yādī al-Yumnā*, *al-Janāiz*, *Nūr al-Abṣar*, *Ḍiyā al-Abṣar*, *Tanwīr al-Abṣar bi Ta'yidī Nūr al-Ibṣar*, and *Al-Qaul al-Sadīd fī ma Yata'allaqu bi Takbīrāt al-'Idī* (Wathoni & Nursyamsu, 2022).

Among the works of al-Mubārakfūrī, the book *Tuḥfah al-Aḥwāzī* is his most renowned among Muslims. This book utilizes the *ijmālī* method to interpret the hadith in *Sunan al-Tirmizī*. In this book, al-Mubārakfūrī employs a systematic writing method that includes quoting the biography of the hadith narrator from biographical sources without adding or subtracting any comments; documenting hadiths written and narrated by Imam al-Tirmizī, then aligning them with the names of narrators agreed upon by hadith scholars; explaining the problematic category of narrators;

interpreting the hadiths based on the opinions of fiqh and hadith scholars and selecting the most appropriate opinion; documenting the hadiths narrated by Imam al-Tirmizī in each chapter and including recitations that have been debated or criticized by hadith scholars (Firdaus, 2014).

Understanding the Hadith of Ibn Ḥazm and al-Mubārakfūrī About Music

Ibn Hazm believes that music is not prohibited because there are no specific arguments that prohibit it. In his book *Rasā'il Ibn Ḥazm*, he rejects the arguments put forward by scholars who prohibit music (Al-Andalusī, 1980). Ibn Ḥazm rejected the hadith which stated that singing and music were forbidden, including the hadith narrated by al-Bukhārī which mentioned the prohibition of musical instruments or what was called *al-Ma'āzif*. The sound of the hadith that Ibn Hazm rejected is:

Meaning: *Hisham bin 'Ammār said that Sadaqah bin Khālīd told him, who was told by 'Abdurrahman bin Yazīd bin Jābir, who was told by 'Aṭīyyah bin Qais al-Kilābī, who was told by 'Abdurrahman bin Ganam al-Ash'arī, who said that Abū Āmir or Abū Mālīk al-Ash'arī, had told him the following: "By Allah, he did not lie to me when he said he had heard the Prophet Muhammad say: "There will be among my people a people who will allow adultery, silk, alcohol, and musical instruments. (Al-Bukhārī, 1993).*

Ibn Hazm questions the authenticity of the mentioned hadith. According to him, Imam al-Bukhari did not clearly state his sources, especially whether the person referred to in the hadith was Abu 'Amir or Abū Mālīk. This lack of clarity in the hadith's sources allows Ibn Hazm to raise doubts about using the hadith to establish the prohibition of musical instruments and singing (Al-Andalusī, 1980).

In his great work *al-Muḥallā*, Ibn Ḥazm also comments on the above hadith. This is different from his statement in his book *Rasā'il* which only doubts the history of al-Bukhārī, but in the book *al-Muḥallā* Ibn Ḥazm explicitly states that the hadith narrated by al-Bukhārī which is the argument for the prohibition of music cannot be used because in the sanad there is a disconnected narrative (*munqaṭī'*) (Al-Andalusī, 1988).

In his book *al-Muḥallā*, Ibn Ḥazm stated that purchasing and selling items such as chess, flutes, psalters, tanburs, and other musical instruments is permissible (*halal*). If anyone damages a musical instrument, they are required to replace it, except if it's only an image or a pattern, in which case there is no compensation. This is because the instrument belongs to the owner. The same ruling applies to buying and selling singers (Al-Andalusī, 1988).

Ibn Ḥazm believes that buying and selling musical instruments is permissible, and there is compensation for anyone who damages the musical instrument. According to Ibn Ḥazm, this belief is based on the words of Allah SWT in Qs. Al-Baqarah verse 29. He postulates that as long as listening to music is permissible, there is no clear argument that prohibits it. Ibn Ḥazm also believes that there is not a single argument that forbids buying and selling musical instruments.

He argues that the arguments that forbid it are not *ṣaḥīḥ* or only some of them are *ṣaḥīḥ*, and therefore they cannot be used as proof to forbid music (Al-Andalusī, 1988).

Among the arguments that prohibit music and were challenged by Ibn Ḥazm, apart from the narration of al-Bukhārī, are as follows:

Meaning: *We narrate from Abū Dāwud al-Ṭayālīsī that Hisyām said, from Yahyā bin Abī Kaṣīr, from Abī Salām, from ‘Abdillāh bin Zaīd bin al-Azrāq, from ‘Uqbah bin ‘Āmir al-Juhanī. He said: Rasūlullāh Ṣaw said, "Everything that makes a person negligent is falsehood, except throwing spears, training horses, joking with one's wife because all of that is true.* (Al-Andalusī, 1988).

Ibn Ḥazm commented on this hadith by stating that the narrator of the hadith, ‘Abdullah bin Zaid, was considered a *majhūl*, which means a narrator with unknown origins. In another version of the narration, the addition of the words “there is nothing that a believer neglects except three things” includes a narrator named Khalid bin Zaid, who is also unknown (*majhūl*) (Al-Andalusī, 1988). There is a hadith that states, “Indeed, Allah forbade female singers, selling them, setting their prices, teaching them, and listening to their singing.” According to Ibn Ḥazm, this hadith includes a narrator named Laīs, who was classified as a weak narrator, and another named Sa‘īd bin Abī Razīn, who was classified as a *majhūl* narrator (Al-Andalusī, 1988).

The hadith mentioned that a group of people from the Ummah will drink alcohol but call it something else, and they will be entertained by music and singers, and then Allah will plunge them into the earth. Ibn Ḥazm commented on this hadith, saying that the narrator Mu‘āwiyah bin Ṣāliḥ was a weak narrator. He also mentioned that the threat in this hadith is not about musical instruments and female singers but about making wine lawful by calling it something else. According to Ibn Ḥazm, in religion, it is not permissible to practice something based on mere opinion (Al-Andalusī, 1988).

From the description provided, it is evident that Ibn Ḥazm did not forbid music due to a lack of evidence supporting the prohibition. This differs from al-Mubārakfūrī, who forbids music based on *ṣaḥīḥ* arguments. In the book *Tuḥfat al-Aḥwazī*, there are two hadiths with different interpretations regarding the prohibition of music or singing. The first hadith states that the emergence of music and female singers is one of fifteen signs of impending disaster. The text reads:

Meaning: *‘Alī bin Ḥujr reported that Muhammad bin Yazīd al-Wasiti heard from al-Mustalim bin Sa‘id who heard from Rumaih al-Juzami who heard from Abū Hurairah that the Prophet (peace be upon him) said: "When the spoils of war are controlled by a certain group, trust is treated as loot, zakat is taken as a fine, knowledge is sought for reasons other than religion, a husband is submissive to his wife but disobedient to his mother, and is close to his friends but distant from his father, when people raise their voices in mosques, the leader of a tribe is the most*

wicked among them, and the leader of a people is the most despicable among them, when a person is honored out of fear of the evil he may cause, when female singers and musical instruments become widespread, and people consume alcohol, and when the last person of the congregation curses those who came before him, then await the time when there will be red winds, earthquakes, landslides, transformations, and other signs of the end of the world, which will come and go rapidly, like an arrangement of worn jewelry whose strings are cut and then the pieces fall one after another. (Al-Tirmizī, 1975).

Meanwhile, the second hadith which shows the existence of permissibility, uses the editorial recommendation of having music on certain occasions, the text reads as follows:

Meaning: *Ahmad bin Muni' reported that Yazīd bin Hārūn said that 'Isa bin Maimun al-Ansari, on the authority of al-Qasim bin Muhammad from 'Aisyah, reported that the Messenger of Allah (peace be upon him) said: "Announce the wedding, hold it in the mosque, and celebrate it with the beating of a tambourine. (Al-Tirmizī, 1975).*

In the first hadith, al-Mubārakfūrī defines the word 'القينات' as a singer. He explains that if someone is not a singer, then there is no prohibition on selling or buying it. Al-Mubārakfūrī also said that taking a price from them is haram, just as it is haram to price grapes to be made into wine (Al-Mubārakfūrī, 1993).

The first hadith mentions a future in which Muslims engage in activities such as music, singing, and consuming wine, indicating that these are forbidden, with music even being equated with *khamar*. One of the fifteen things mentioned in the hadith is raising the voice in the mosque, such as engaging in buying and selling with loud voices, playing games, and creating other distracting sounds, including music and singing. According to the Ḥanafī school of thought, even raising one's voice in a mosque to recite the dhikr of Allah is forbidden. Al-Mubārakfūrī stated that forbidden musical instruments include the *duff* (tambourine) and other types of instruments that can be struck (Al-Mubārakfūrī, 1993).

In the hadith that discusses the permissibility of music, according to al-Mubārakfūrī, it is explained that what separates the permissible (*ḥalāl*) from the impermissible (*ḥarām*) in the context of music is the difference in the way music is enjoyed, particularly at weddings when it involves the use of voice and tambourine. It is emphasized that this distinction is not to be generalized to all aspects of marital life but rather is meant to enhance the joyous occasions and formalize the marriage in the presence of witnesses, preventing any secrecy or ambiguity. The directive to hold such celebrations in the mosque is intended to seek blessings, as the mosque is considered a sacred place. However, it is specified that the music, particularly involving the tambourine, should not be played inside the mosque, but outside it (Al-Mubārakfūrī, 1993).

Comparative Analysis of Ibn Ḥazm and al-Mubārakfūrī's Hadith Understanding of Music

Ibn Ḥazm's argument for rejecting al-Bukhari's hadith is why he still believes it is permissible to use musical instruments. There is a rebuttal to Ibn Ḥazm's comments on the hadith narrated by al-Bukhārī. Ibn Qayyim mentions this rebuttal in his book *Igāsatu al-Lahafān min Maṣayid al-Shayṭān*, stating that this hadith is authentic and uncontaminated. This can be discerned from various perspectives.

1. Al-Bukhārī met Hisham bin 'Ammār and learned this hadith from him. If al-Bukhārī said 'قال هشام' this is the same as saying he used the word 'عن هشام'.
2. If al-Bukhārī hadn't heard this hadith from Hisyām, al-Bukhārī would not have explicitly mentioned the hadith.
3. Al-Bukhārī mentions this hadith in *mu'allaq* with firm expressions rather than the other way around. If the authenticity of the hadith has not been agreed upon or has not met the requirements, al-Bukhārī will mention it with the words 'narrated from Rasulullah'. However, if al-Bukhārī says 'Rasulullah said', then he has firmly narrated and confirmed the attribution to Rasulullah Saw (Al-Jauziyah, 1998).

In response to Ibn Ḥazm's opinion about the authenticity of the hadith, Ibn Ḥajar al-'Asqalānī has pointed out a mistake. Upon conducting further research, it was explained that the use of the word 'قال' by al-Bukhārī made the hadith *mu'allaq*. According to the rule followed by those who memorize hadiths, the narration mentioned by al-Bukhārī in *mu'allaq* is considered *ṣaḥīḥ* to the narrator from whom al-Bukhārī narrated the hadith in *mu'allaq* form, even if that person was not al-Bukhārī's teacher (Al-'Asqalānī, 1970).

According to Ibn Ḥazm, the permissibility of using musical instruments and other forms of entertainment is based on whether they involve any immorality. If there are immoral elements, Ibn Ḥazm forbids their use. However, if there are no immoral elements, then their use is permissible, especially if they can bring one closer to Allah Swt (Al-Andalusī, 1988).

Ibn Ḥazm didn't talk much about the types of musical instruments. This is consistent with the general opinion that all musical instruments are allowed as long as they don't contain immoral elements. Even if a musical instrument is used just for fun, entertainment, or other purposes without immoral elements, it is considered permissible. Therefore, it makes sense that he didn't provide more details about the types of musical instruments of his time. Explaining further would contradict this idea and lead back to the original point of avoiding immoral elements.

Based on Ibn Ḥazm's opinion, all modern musical instruments may be currently permitted. The music industry is rapidly developing with a variety of different forms and functions, including guitars, flutes, violins, pianos, and both traditional and modern musical instruments. If these musical instruments are used solely for entertainment, particularly to get closer to Allah Swt, for example, using

them to sing religious songs or play harp music, then all are permitted. Ibn Ḥazm's main consideration is that there must be no immoral elements in their use.

According to al-Mubārakfūrī's opinion, music is considered forbidden, similar to the prohibition of drinking alcohol. The practice of combining singing with forbidden activities such as drinking alcohol and other morally corrupt behaviors, as well as the spread of news about moral corruption among artists, has led scholars to prohibit music. In his explanation of a hadith, Al-Mubārakfūrī provides concise and clear interpretations. He explains that the prohibition of singing and music is absolute, similar to the prohibition of selling singers. Therefore, he asserts that the prohibition of music is unequivocal and is likened to the prohibition of wine.

Penutup

Music is a form of artistic expression that involves arranging words in rhythm to create harmony when heard. There are varying opinions among scholars regarding the prohibition of music in Islamic law. Ibn Ḥazm believes that anything not explicitly forbidden is permissible, including music. He also argues that the hadith on which scholars rely to prohibit music is weak, including the history of al-Bukhārī. Ibn Ḥazm believed that the permissibility of music depends on whether it involves any immoral behavior. If a musical instrument is used in an immoral way, Ibn Ḥazm considers it not permissible. On the other hand, if there is no immorality involved, then music is permissible according to him. Al-Mubarakfūrī, on the other hand, generally forbade music, but he did make exceptions for certain occasions.

The disagreement between scholars on this issue lies in their interpretations of Ibn Ḥazm and al-Mubārakfūrī's opinions. It does not include differences of opinion that allow someone to choose an opinion based on the arguments of both scholars. This is because there is a hadith that invalidates one of the two views. In this case, Ibn Ḥazm's opinion regarding a hadith, which he initially thought was weak, turned out to be a reliable hadith, and its authenticity was confirmed by the scholars. On the other hand, al-Mubārakfūrī believed that music and musical instruments are forbidden, while simultaneously allowing them in certain circumstances.

Daftar Pustaka

- Akbar, A., Yuhasnibar, & Jufrihisham, M. N. A. bin. (2019). Hukum Walimah al-'Urs Menurut Perspektif Ibnu Ḥazm al-Andalusī. *El-Usrah: Jurnal Hukum Keluarga*, 2(2), 153–179. <https://doi.org/10.22373/ujhk.v2i2.7653>
- Al-'Asqalānī, A. bin 'Alī bin Ḥajar. (1970). *Fath al-Bārī*. al-Maktabah al-Salafiyyah.
- Al-Andalusī, A. M. 'Alī bin A. bin S. bin Ḥazm. (1980). *Rasāil Ibnu Ḥazm al-Andalusī* (Vol. 1). al-Muassasah al-'Arābiyah.
- Al-Andalusī, A. M. 'Alī bin A. bin S. bin Ḥazm. (1988). *al-Muḥallā bi al-Aṣar* (Vol. 7). Dār al-Fikr.
- Al-Bukhārī, A. 'Abdillāh M. bin I. (1993). *Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhārī* (Vol. 6). Dār Ibnu Kaṣīr.

- Al-Jauziyah, S. M. bin A. B. I. Q. (1998). *Igāṣatu al-Lahafān min Maṣāyidi al-Syaiṭān* (Vol. 1). al-Maktabah al-Ma'ārif.
- Al-Mubārakfūrī, A. al-'Ulā M. 'Abdurrahmān bin 'Abdurrahīm. (1993). *Tuhfat al-Aḥwazī bi Syarḥ Jāmi' al-Tirmizī* (Vol. 4). Dār al-Kutb al-'Ilmiyah.
- Al-Tirmizī, M. bin 'Īsa bin S. M. bin al-Ḍaḥḥāk A. 'Īsa. (1975). *Sunan al-Tirmizī*. Muṣṭafā al-Bābī al-Ḥalabī.
- Ardena, A. R. (2020). Analisis Struktur Lagu Biar Menjadi Kenangan Ciptaan Ahmad Dhani. *Jurnal Sendratasik*, 9(3), 15–27. <https://doi.org/10.24036/jsu.v9i1.109300>
- As'ad, M., Lazib, I., & Ramdhani, I. (2023). Bermain atau Sepenuhnya Meninggalkan Musik: Dua Narasi Artis Hijrah pada Hukum Bermain Musik. *TJISS: Tebui reng Journal of Islamic and Society*, 4(1), 100–116. <https://doi.org/10.33752/tjiss.v4i1>
- Djohan, Tyasrinestu, F., & Sualang, L. A. E. (2022). Pengaruh Mendengarkan Musik Terhadap Kondisi Relaksasi. *Resital: Jurnal Seni Pertunjukan*, 23(3), 190–201. <https://doi.org/10.24821/resital.v23i3>
- Ferdiansyah, H. (2015). Orientasi Fikih al-Tirmizi. *Al-Manahij: Jurnal Kajian Hukum Islam*, 9(1), 21–30. <https://doi.org/10.24090/mnh.v9i1.509>
- Firdaus. (2014). Kitab Tuhfat al-Ahwadzī Syarḥ Jāmi' al-Tirmidzī (Sebuah Studi Kitab Syarah Hadis Karya al-Mubārakfūrī). *Al-Qalam: Jurnal Kajian Islam & Pendidikan*, 6(1), 30–36. <https://doi.org/10.47435/al-qalam.v6i1.114>
- Herlina, E. R. (2023). Pandangan Islam Terhadap Gaya Hidup Hedonisme Pada Generasi Z. *Andragogi: Jurnal Ilmiah Pendidikan Agama Islam*, 5(1), 1–10. <https://doi.org/10.33474/ja.v5i1.16183>
- Ḥimāyah, M. 'Alī. (2017). *Ibnu Ḥazm Imām Fiqih, Filosof & Sastrawan Abad Ke-4 H (Biografi, Karya, dan Kajiannya Tentang Agama-Agama)*. Lentera.
- Ikhwanisyah, M. F., Hunainah, & Ramdhani, M. T. (2023). Basic Concepts of Islamic Education: The perspective of Al-Rahiq Al-Makhtum Kitab. *INSANIA: Jurnal Pemikiran Alternatif Kependidikan*, 28(2), 207–220. <https://doi.org/10.24090/insania.v28i2.8548>
- Indah, I., Robiansyah, F., & Darmawan. (2021). Konsep Pendidikan Akhlak Dalam Sirah Nabawiyah Karya Syaikh Shafiyyurrahman al-Mubarakfuri dan Implikasinya Dalam Pembelajaran Agama Islam di Sekolah Dasar. *Taklim: Jurnal Pendidikan Agama Islam*, 19(1), 155–168. <https://doi.org/10.17509/tk.v19i1>
- Indonesia, T. P. K. B. (2018). *Kamus Besar Bahasa Indonesia* (2nd ed.). Pusat Bahasa.
- Izani, R., & Rubini. (2021). Pendidikan Karakter dalam Buku Sirah Nabawiyah Karya Syaikh Shafiyyurrahman al-Mubarakfuri. *Al-Manar: Jurnal Komunikasi Dan Pendidikan Islam*, 10(1), 103–114.
- Khoiriyah, N., & Sinaga, S. S. (2017). Pemanfaatan Pemutaran Musik Terhadap Psikologis Pasien Pada Klinik Ellena Skin Care di Kota Surakarta. *Jurnal Seni Musik*, 6(2), 81–90. <https://doi.org/10.15294/jsm.v6i2>

- Komala, F., & Ridwan, M. (2022). Keindahan dalam Perspektif Hukum Islam. *Jurnal Indragiri Penelitian Multidisiplin*, 2(3), 140–146. <https://doi.org/10.58707/jipm.v2i3.221>
- Lesmana P, L. A., Suresman, E., & Suryana, A. T. (2015). Implementasi Dakwah Islam Melalui Seni Musik Islami (Studi Deskriptif Pada Grup Nasyid EdCooustic). *Tarbawy: Indonesian Journal of Islamic Education*, 2(1), 1–17. <https://doi.org/10.17509/t.v2i1.3376>
- Mahmud, A. (2017). Musik; Antara Halal dan Haram (Kajian Ma'ān al-Hadis). *Mafhum: Jurnal Ilmu Al-Qur'an Dan Tafsir*, 2(2), 251–284. jurnal.yudharta.ac.id/v2/index.php/mafhum/article/view/931
- Marwi, A. S., Lubis, I. R., Sinurat, Y., Ulfa, S. W., & Nainggolan, T. H. B. (2023). Pengaruh Media Musik dan Lagu dalam Pembelajaran Biologi. *Sinar Dunia: Jurnal Riset Sosial Humaniora Dan Ilmu Pendidikan*, 2(1), 74–86. <https://doi.org/10.58192/sidu.v2i1>
- Muhabbatillah, S., & Gunawan, T. (2020). Pola Komunikasi Penyanyi Dangdut, Konflik, dan Resolusi Penyelesaiannya (Studi pada Penyanyi Dangdut di Desa Banjarsawah, Kecamatan Tegalsiwalan, Kabupaten Probolinggo). *JSHP: Jurnal Sosial Humaniora Dan Pendidikan*, 4(1), 1–7. <https://doi.org/10.32487/jshp.v4i1>
- Muhammad, H. (2015). *Perempuan Ulama di Atas Panggung Sejarah*. Diva Press.
- Mursī, M. S. (2015). *Uzamā'u al-Islām 'Abra Arba'ah 'Asyra Qarnān min al-Zamān*. Muassasah al-Risālah.
- Muṣṭafā, I. (2004). *Al-Mu'jam al-Wasīf*. Maktabah al-Syurūq al-Dauliyyah.
- Najamudin, M., & Riadi, H. (2019). Irian Musik Teater Tubau Kalimantan Selatan. *Geter: Jurnal Seni Drama, Tari Dan Musik*, 2(1), 34–45. <https://doi.org/10.26740/geter.v2n1>
- Parmajaya, I. P. G. (2020). Seni Sakral dan Sekuler Suatu Problema Dalam Kehidupan Sosial Religius: Perspektif Yadnya Umat Hindu di Bali. *Kamaya: Jurnal Ilmu Agama*, 3(1), 59–76. <https://doi.org/10.37329/kamaya.v3i1.377>
- Rahwan, & Baharun, M. (2022). Musik Sebagai Media Dakwah Dalam Pandangan Syafi'iyah. *Maddah: Jurnal Komunikasi & Konseling Islam*, 4(1), 1–13. <https://doi.org/10.35316/maddah.v4i1.1725>
- Rizqi, H. M. (2023). Andalusian Period Literary Criticism: Factors of Influence of Emergence, Trends and Critics. *Jurnal Ilmiah AL-Jauhari: Jurnal Studi Islam Dan Interdisipliner*, 8(2), 171–185. <https://doi.org/10.30603/jiaj.v8i2.3945>
- Sahputra, V. N., & Farma, M. D. (2023). Ibnu Hazm: (384 H/994 M-456 H/1064 M) Epistemologi dalam Pendidikan. *Al-Mabhats: Jurnal Penelitian Agama*, 8(2), 105–124. <https://doi.org/10.47766/almabhats.v8i2.2076>
- Salam, N. (2019). Kepemimpinan dan Nafkah Keluarga dalam Perspektif Nalar Tekstualis Ibnu Hazm Al-Dzahiriyy. *De Jure: Jurnal Hukum Dan Syari'ah*, 11(1), 48–62. <https://doi.org/10.18860/j-fsh.v11i1.6574>

- Simatupang, N. D., & Rosalianisa, R. (2021). Pengaruh Alat Permainan Edukatif Kereta Musik Terhadap Perkembangan Bahasa Anak Usia 5-6 Tahun. *Jeced: Journal of Early Childhood and Development*, 3(2), 107–120. <https://doi.org/10.15642/jeced.v3i2.1404>
- Siregar, M. N. (2018). Psikoterapi Bersama Nabi. *Al-Bukhārī: Jurnal Ilmu Hadis*, 1(1), 19–36. <https://doi.org/10.32505/al-bukhari.v1i1.440>
- Sugiyono. (2018). *Metode Penelitian Kuantitatif, Kualitatif dan R&D*. Alfabeta.
- Suherman, J., & Hafis, M. (2022). The Obligation Attend Witness in Talak in Religious Courts and its Relevance to Ibnu Hazm's Views. *Jurnal Ilmiah Ahwal Syakhshiyah (JAS)*, 4(2), 285–304. <https://doi.org/10.33474/jas.v4i2.18909>
- Sunarto. (2016). Estetika Musik: Autonomis versus Heteronomis dan Konteks Sejarah Musik. *Jurnal Pengkajian, Penyajian, Dan Penciptaan Musik*, 4(2), 102–116. <https://doi.org/10.24821/promusika.v4i2>
- Syaf'i, A. G., & Rahman. (2022). Seni Sebagai Media Dakwah Dalam Pemberdayaan Masyarakat. *Qalam: Jurnal Ilmiah Keagamaan Dan Kemasyarakatan*, 16(4), 1512–1520. <https://doi.org/10.35931/aq.v16i4.1189>
- Waddin, M. A. H. K. M., & Fikriyah, T. (2022). Konsep Kafa'ah Dalam Hukum Islam (Studi Komparasi Pemikiran Antara Imam Syafi'i Dalam Kitab Al-Umm Dan Imam Ibnu Hazm Dalam Kitab Al-Muhalla). *Mabahits: Jurnal Hukum Keluarga*, 3(1), 61–84. <https://doi.org/10.36835/mabahits.v3i1>
- Wathoni, L. M. N., & Nursyamsu. (2022). Moral Education in The Book Arrahīqu Almakhtūm by Shakh Shafy al-Rahmān Al-mubārakfūrī. *Qalamuna: Jurnal Pendidikan*, 14(2), 337–354. <https://doi.org/10.37680/qalamuna.v14i2.3166>
- Yuliarizki, D. (2023). Kajian Alat Musik dalam Perspektif Hadis dan Korelasinya dengan Sholawat. *UinScof: The Ushuluddin International Student Conference*, 438–448. proceedings.radenfatah.ac.id/index.php/UInScof2022/article/view/579
- Yuniar, P., Sitoena, J. K., Matius, D. M., & Obed, G. B. (2022). Sejarah Musik Sebagai Dasar Pengetahuan dalam Pembelajaran Teori Musik. *Clef: Jurnal Musik Dan Pendidikan Musik*, 3(2), 141–150. <https://doi.org/10.51667/cjmpm.v3i2>
- Yusram, M., Wijaya, H., Iskandar, A., & Fadli, M. (2020). Analisis Komparasi Pemikiran Ibnu Ḥazm dan Syāfi'ī Terhadap Hukum Musik. *Bustanul Fuqaha: Jurnal Bidang Hukum Islam*, 1(4), 627–649. <https://doi.org/10.36701/bustanul.v1i4.280>
- Zuhri. (2016). Ibnu Ḥazm al-Andalusī dan Khilāfah. *Esensia: Jurnal Ilmu-Ilmu Ushuluddin*, 17(2), 141–154. <https://doi.org/10.14421/esensia.v17i2.1284>